al-IBAANAH
AUTHENTIC BOOK PUBLISHING

صلاة العيد في المصلى هي السنة

Praying 'Eid in the Musallaa is the Sunnah

By Imaam Muhammad Naasir-ud-Deen Al-Albaanee [Died: 1419H]

Translated by abu maryam isma'eel alarcon

al-ibaanah e-books

First Edition: October 2005

About the Book: This book is a complete translation of the booklet ***Salaat-ul-'Eidayn fil-Musallaa hiya as-Sunnah*** (Praying 'Eid in the *Musallaa* is the Sunnah) of Imaam Muhammad Naasir-ud-Deen Al-Albaanee, published by Al-Maktab-ul-Islamee (3rd Edition, 1986).

We present this treatise to our noble readers, in the hopes to convey knowledge of this lost Sunnah, which is: Praying 'Eid in the Musallaa. Imaam Al-Albaanee, in his own unique style, discusses this topic in depth providing the evidences and sayings of the scholars to support his view, all while being brief and concise in his presentation. This is one of the celebrated works of Imaam Al-Albaanee that reflects his vast knowledge and high understanding.

We ask Allaah to benefit the Muslims with this book, and to revive this important aspect of the Sunnah in the lands of the west.

A Publication of
Al-Ibaanah E-Books

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

All praise is for Allaah, alone, and may His Peace and Blessings be on our Prophet Muhammad, his family, his Companions, and those who follow his guidance, while being steadfast upon his way until the Day of Recompense. To Proceed:

This is our treatise for today, and its topic consists of affirming that: **"Performing the Two 'Eid Prayers in the Musallaa outside the city is the Sunnah."** [1]

I had the idea of making this a comprehensive treatise, containing all the rulings for the two 'Eid Prayers, similar to my treatise *Salaat-ut-Taraaweeh*. However, time has surpassed me such that only several days remain until 'Eid-ul-Fitr. Due to this, I was pressed to limit this treatise to just this discussion, which I mentioned above. I hope that Allaah will enable me in the near future to publish the complete and comprehensive treatise and to spread it out to the people, whom I hope will gratefully accept my treatises. And I hope that perhaps I may attain a righteous supplication from them in private, which will benefit me on:

يَوْمَ لَا يَنفَعُ مَالٌ وَلَا بَنُونَ ﴿٨٨﴾ إِلَّا مَنْ أَتَى ٱللَّهَ بِقَلْبٍ سَلِيمٍ

"The Day when neither one's wealth nor children will be of avail, except for he who comes to Allaah with a pure heart." [Surah Ash-Shu'araa: 88-89]

So know O noble reader: That those authors darkened two large pages in their treatise *Al-Isaabah* (pg. 14-15) discussing the subject of "Praying 'Eid in the Musallaa." In it, they fell into such shameful contradictions, that it will become clear to the reader "their share of knowledge!" And they lied on us in that treatise of theirs claiming that we say: "The 'Eid Prayer (performed) in the Masaajid is not valid!"

They said: "The reason why the Prophet ﷺ chose to perform the 'Eid Prayer in the *musallaa* was due to the lack [as he states][2] of there being sufficient means in Madeenah, such as that there didn't exist any masjid in Madeenah except one."

---

[1] **Translator's Note:** The word *musallaa* here refers to an area of open (flat) land that is apart from the masjid and outside of the city limits. Although, it is used commonly for any place of prayer that is not a masjid, in this treatise the word *musallaa* has been left un-translated to bear the above meaning, in accordance with its understanding derived from the ahaadeeth of the Prophet, mentioned later on in this treatise.

[2] **Translator's Note:** The Shaikh's words that occur in parentheses have been placed in brackets for this translation. As for the words that appear in parentheses throughout this treatise, then they were added by the translator to provide a better understanding of the source material.

This is profound ignorance, since the masaajid in Madeenah during the time of the Prophet ﷺ were many and well known, the most famous of which were Masjid Qubaa, Masjid Qiblatayn and Masjid Al-Fat'h. There are many authentic ahaadeeth reported about these masaajid in the books of Sunnah. In *Fat'h-ul-Baaree* (1/445), Al-Haafidh (Ibn Hajr) also mentioned other masaajid by name, so whoever wishes can refer to it.

Their intent behind this false claim was to try and seek a way towards negating the Sunnah of praying 'Eid in the *Musallaa*, by fabricating this futile justification, which is: "That there wasn't any masjid in Madeenah except for the Prophet's Masjid." So according to this, they claimed that there wasn't enough room for the Muslims to perform the 'Eid Prayer there!

And we have established the falseness of this justification due to the falseness of the claim from its very foundation. So here we say:

If we assume that the Prophet's Masjid wasn't big enough for them, then surely they would have been able to pray in these other masaajid that existed (at the Prophet's time), as the people do today. So their abandoning praying in these masaajid in favor of praying in the *musallaa* is a clear proof that the Sunnah is praying in the *musallaa* and not in the masjid. So the actual intent has been established and what they desired from negating (of this Sunnah) has been annulled!

Then they said: "So when the Muslims grew in number, such that it became difficult for the Muslims to gather in the *musallaa*, especially in the larger cities such as Damascus, due to the large amount of prayer attendees, they began to gather together in the various masaajid in accordance with necessity"!

I say: Look, O noble reader, at this contradicting statement, where they make the Muslims gathering together in the *musallaa* something difficult, when in fact it is something simple and easy. The proof for this is that this act has been practiced in a majority of the lands, as Imaam An-Nawawee stated in his *Sharh* (Explanation) of Saheeh Muslim. His words will be quoted in: **"The Proofs in the Ahaadeeth that indicate that Praying in the Musallaa is the Sunnah."**

This Sunnah has not ceased to be implemented up to this day, by Allaah's Bounty, in many of the Muslim lands, such as Damascus, Jordan, Egypt, Algeria, Hijaaz, Pakistan and other areas.

Furthermore, what **"necessity"** is there in splitting up the unified body (Jamaa'ah) of Muslims into these various masaajid, whether big or small, which are established in every place (?) and some of which are so close to one another that at times there can only be found between two of them the distance of fifty feet or less!

If these authors had restricted their words to just mean that they began to gather together to pray in the one large (central) masjid (and not various masaajid), they would have had some Salaf (i.e. scholars of the past) that held this view before them, as will be mentioned later about Imaam Ash-Shaafi’ee, may Allaah have mercy on him.

However, they feel no hesitancy in saying something that no Muslim before them ever said, all for the sake of waging war against the Sunnah! And if this is not so, then the Muslims all unanimously agree that performing the ‘Eid Prayer in the *musallaa* is the Sunnah, *if* there is not sufficient space for them in the masjid. Furthermore, a majority of them did not accept this condition and instead said: “Even if there is sufficient space in the masjid.” So, out of their ignorance, they have opposed all of the Muslims – those of the past (Salaf) and those of the present (Khalaf). And Allaah, the Most High, says:

وَمَن يُشَاقِقِ ٱلرَّسُولَ مِنۢ بَعۡدِ مَا تَبَيَّنَ لَهُ ٱلۡهُدَىٰ وَيَتَّبِعۡ غَيۡرَ سَبِيلِ
ٱلۡمُؤۡمِنِينَ نُوَلِّهِۦ مَا تَوَلَّىٰ وَنُصۡلِهِۦ جَهَنَّمَۖ وَسَآءَتۡ مَصِيرًا ﴿١١٥﴾

“And whoever contradicts the Messenger after the guidance has been made clear to him, and follows a way other than the Way of the Believers, We will turn him to what he has chosen and land him in Hell – what an evil destination.” [Surah An-Nisaa: 115] So stick to the Sunnah, O people!

They went on to say: “…they then began to gather together in the various masaajid according to necessity, based on the action of the Prophet ﷺ when he prayed in the masjid due to difficulty (i.e. an excuse).”

And in their notes, they mentioned the hadeeth of Abu Hurairah, in which the Prophet ﷺ prayed in the masjid due to the excuse of rain.

The response to this is that the hadeeth of Abu Hurairah – if it is authentic – serves as a proof for us because what is understood from it is that if it weren’t for the excuse of rain, he ﷺ would have prayed in the *musallaa*. No other Muslim apart from you opposes this, for all of your previously mentioned words indicate that you hold the view that praying in the *musallaa* is not legislated nowadays, since it is difficult, as you claim! And we have replied to you, so the hadeeth goes back as a proof against you and not for you. And all of this is said ***assuming*** that the hadeeth is authentic. However, it is not authentic. On the contrary its chain of narration is weak, as we will explain later.

The rest of their words are mere foolishness and do not deserve to be replied to, except for the statement they made after first listing the following hadeeth of Abu Sa'eed and then that of Abu Hurairah: "So we derive from these two ahaadeeth that the prayer is valid in the *musallaa* as well as in the masjid and that there is reward in both of them. Likewise, it is derived from the first hadeeth that it is better to pray it (i.e. the 'Eid Prayer) in an open area of land, due to the Prophet's constantly doing that."

I say: So look at them, O noble reader, how they returned to the correct view that we are calling to. So by saying this, they have joined us in contradicting their previous words. But do you think that they settled upon this view? No, rather they go back to the same view that they began with, for after quoting from Al-Haafidh Ibn Hajr, the statement of Imaam Ash-Shaafi'ee, which will be mentioned later, they went on to say:

"So whoever pays careful attention to what has been stated previously along with the hadeeth of Al-Bukhaaree[3] from Umm 'Atiyyah that: **'Allaah's Messenger ﷺ commanded us to bring out the women for (the 'Eids of) Fitr and Adhaa – the young girls, the menstruating women and those females who conceal themselves at home. As for the menstruating women, then they would refrain from the prayer.'**

In one wording (of the hadeeth): **'…they would refrain from the *musallaa*, but they would witness the good and the supplication of the Muslims.'**

He will come to realize that the reason the Prophet ﷺ persevered on praying in the *musallaa* was due to the fact that: The Prophet's masjid was not spacious enough to hold the men and women for those two days or due to the fact that it is not correct for the menstruating women to attend the masjid."

I say: We have reflected upon all of these words and found that they are baseless just like the rest of their words!

So let's say if we were to agree with them that the Prophet's masjid was not big enough for the men and women, then this is the same case with our present-day masaajid in that not one of them is capable of holding all of those intending prayer. So what remains valid is the legality of going out to perform the prayer in the *musallaa*. This is the required outcome (from that argument).

Furthermore, if according to them it is not correct for the menstruating women to attend the masjid, then this is an acknowledgement on their part that it is correct for them to attend the *musallaa*. So when they require that the 'Eid Prayer be performed in the

[3] I say: His attributing it to Al-Bukhaaree with the following wording is erroneous. Rather, it is only this way in *Saheeh Muslim* (3/20-21; Istanbul copy)

masaajid, then this means that they are preventing these (menstruating) women from **"witnessing the good and the supplication of the Muslims!"**

This is contrary to the command of Allaah's Messenger ﷺ found in the hadeeth, which they attributed to Al-Bukhaaree, for the hadeeth is one of our proofs that indicate that the 'Eid Prayer should be held in the *musallaa* and not in the masjid. This is because the masjid, no matter how big it is, is incapable of accommodating the attendance of all of the men and women in it, according to their own acknowledgement.

And from our proofs against them is their statement: "And the women would go out to the *musallaa* – even the menstruating women – to participate in the *takbeer*."

So we must ask them: "How is it possible for you to implement this Sunnah in the masaajid?! There is no way for you to do this unless you unrestrictedly prevent the (menstruating) women from attending." And this is in opposition to the order of Allaah's Messenger ﷺ as has been stated previously. And in the case that you do order them to attend but to stay outside of the masjid behind its walls and fences, then how will they be able to participate in the takbeer under these circumstances?!

So look, O noble Muslim brother, at what ignorance can due to the one who has it, and take heed!

Important Note: It has become clear from what we quoted from these authors that they hold that it is legislated for the women to go out to the *musallaa*, even if they are young girls, for they are what are referred to (in the hadeeth) as the '*awaatiq*. So remember this, for perhaps there will come a day when these authors will begin to reject what they acknowledged previously, when they see the supporters of the Sunnah acting upon this, out of envy and hatred deeply rooted within themselves!

Even though we encourage the women to attend the *Jamaa'ah* (gathering) of the Muslims, carrying out the order of Allaah's Messenger ﷺ, we must not forget to direct their attention, as well as the attention of their male guardians, to the obligation of women abiding by the legislated Hijaab.

And this entails the impermissibility for them to expose any part of their bodies except their hands and faces, according to what I explained in detail in my book **"The Muslim Woman's Hijaab according to the Qur'aan and Sunnah."** Allaah, Blessed and Exalted, says:

يَٰٓأَيُّهَا ٱلنَّبِيُّ قُل لِّأَزْوَٰجِكَ وَبَنَاتِكَ وَنِسَآءِ ٱلْمُؤْمِنِينَ يُدْنِينَ عَلَيْهِنَّ
مِن جَلَٰبِيبِهِنَّ ۚ ذَٰلِكَ أَدْنَىٰٓ أَن يُعْرَفْنَ فَلَا يُؤْذَيْنَ ۗ وَكَانَ ٱللَّهُ غَفُورًا
رَّحِيمًا ﴿٥٩﴾

“O Prophet! Tell your wives, your daughters, and the believing women to place their jilbaabs upon themselves. That is better that they may be known so as not to be molested. And Allaah is the Most Forgiving, Bestower of Mercy.” [Surah Al-Ahzaab: 59]

In spite of this, we must clearly state here that it is better for them to also cover these two areas (of the face and hands), contrary to what has been attributed to me by some authors who do not fear the Lord of the Worlds!

Some people are shocked with the view that it is legislated for the women to go out to the *musallaa* for the two ‘Eid Prayers. So let them know that: This is the truth of which there is no doubt, due to the many ahaadeeth reported in that regard. Sufficient for us here is the afore-mentioned hadeeth of Umm ‘Atiyyah, for it is not only a proof for its legality, but rather it is a proof for it’s being obligated upon them, based on Allaah’s Messenger ﷺ commanding it. This is since the foundation with regard to an order from the Prophet is that the matter becomes obligatory.

And what further supports this is what has been reported by Ibn Abee Shaybah in *al-Musannaf* (2/184) from Abu Bakr As-Siddeeq ؓ that he said: “It is a duty upon every female possessing a girth [which resembles a garment with a waistband] (i.e. a female) to come out to the two ‘Eid Prayers.” Its chain of narration is authentic

So do those who claim to support the rightly-guided Khaleefahs hold this view, when the first amongst them (i.e. Abu Bakr) held it, as you have just seen with its reference and authentication? That is what we do not think about them (i.e. that they do not hold this view). So let them prove these thoughts of ours wrong – and that is what would be more beloved to us. And if not, then their intention behind their alleged “support” will become clear to the people.

The view that it is obligatory is what As-San’aanee has demonstrated in (his book) *Subul-us-Salaam*, as well as Ash-Shawkaanee and Sideeq (Hasan) Khaan. And this is the view that is apparent from the words of Ibn Hazm. It also looks as if Ibn Taimiyyah

inclined toward this view in his *Ikhtiyaaraat*, and Allaah knows best. [The First: pg. 9-10][4]

So in summary, we say: Indeed the Sunnah *is* to perform the 'Eid Prayer in the *musallaa*. In spite of this, it is permissible to perform it in the masaajid. I promised there (i.e. his book *Tasdeed-ul-Isaabah*) that I would affirm this view in this treatise.

So now the time has come to fulfill this promise, so I say:

[4] This is his treatise *"Min Tasdeed-il-Isaabah ilaa man za'ama Nusrat-al-Khulafaa-ir-Raashideen was-Sahaabah."* [Zuhair] **Translator's Note:** All footnotes in the treatise are from the words of Imaam Al-Albaanee. Some footnotes have also been added by Zuhair Shawaish, and we have annotated them by putting them in brackets (i.e. [Zuhair]). However the readers must know that Imaam Al-Albaanee stopped publishing books with this man, in his latter days, due to some of his works being printed and tampered with without his permission. And Allaah knows best.

THE PROPHET'S PERSEVERANCE UPON PRAYING 'EID IN THE MUSALLAA & THE AHAADEETH REPORTED IN THAT REGARD

More than one of the trustworthy scholars of Hadeeth have stated that: "The Prophet's guidance with regard to performing the two 'Eid Prayers was that he would always do them in the *musallaa*." [5]

This is supported by the many ahaadeeth that have been reported in this regard in the two *Saheehs*, the *Sunan* collections, the *Musnad* collections and other sources through many paths of narration. We must mention some of these ahaadeeth in this short treatise so that the correct view that I stated before will become clear to the noble reader. So I say:

The First Hadeeth: From Abu Sa'eed Al-Khudree ﷺ who said:

"Allaah's Messenger ﷺ would go out on the Day of Fitr and Adhaa to the *musallaa*.[6] The first thing he would begin with would be the prayer. Then he would finish, and stand up facing the people while they were sitting in rows. And so he would admonish them, advise them and order them. So if he wanted an army band to go out, he would dispatch them,[7] and if he wanted to order something, he would order it. Then he would finish. And the people would continue doing this (after him)."

Reported by Al-Bukhaaree (2/259-260), Muslim (3/20), An-Nasaa'ee (1/234), Al-Muhaamilee in *Kitaab-ul-'Eidayn* (vol. 2, no. 86, from my manuscript with my handwriting), Abu Nu'aim in his *Mustakhraj* (2/10/2), and Al-Bayhaqee in his *Sunan* (3/280).

The Second Hadeeth: From 'Abdullaah bin 'Umar ﷺ who said:

"He ﷺ would set out for the *musallaa* on the Day of 'Eid while carrying a spear ('*anazah*)[8] in front of him. So when he would reach the *musallaa*, he would prop it in

---

[5] See *Zaad al-Ma'aad* (1/172) and *Fat'h-ul-Baaree* (2/361) of Al-Haafidh Ibn Hajr, whose words on this subject will be mentioned later. Also refer to the abridged version of *Zaad al-Ma'aad* of Imaam Muhammad bin 'Abdil-Wahhaab (pg. 44).

[6] Al-Haafidh (Ibn Hajr) said: "It is a well known place in Madeenah. There is about one thousand cubits between it and the door of the masjid." I say: It appears that it was to the east of the Prophet's Masjid, close to *al-Baqee'* cemetery, as can be derived from the **Third Hadeeth** mentioned later.

[7] This means: A group out of the army would go out to some destination (See *al-Fat'h*). I say: There is a strong indication in this that the 'Eid Khutbah is not limited to admonishing and counseling only. Rather, it also includes reminding and instructing towards all of those things by which one can achieve benefit for the ummah.

[8] In *an-Nihaayah* it states: The '*anazah* is about half the size of the javelin and a bigger object. It has teeth (points) just like that on a javelin. The staffed spear is closes to it in resemblance.

front of him and pray towards it (i.e. using it as a *sutrah*). This is since the *musallaa* would be a vast empty area, which had nothing in it to screen oneself with."

Reported by Al-Bukhaaree (1/354), Muslim (2/55), Abu Dawood (1/109), An-Nasaa'ee (1/232), Ibn Maajah (1/392) and Ahmad (no. 6286). The wording here is from Ibn Maajah, which has the most complete (wording), and its chain of narration is authentic. It has also been reported by Al-Muhaamilee (2/no. 26-36), Abul-Qaasim Ash-Shahaamee in *Tuhfat-ul-'Eid* (no. 14-16, of my manuscript with my son's handwriting), and Al-Bayhaqee (3/284-285).

The Third Hadeeth: From Al-Baraa bin 'Aazib ﷺ who said:

"The Prophet ﷺ went out on the Day of Adhaa to *Al-Baqee'* [9] [and in another narration: to the *musallaa*] and prayed two rak'aat. Then he turned and faced us and said: **'Verily, the first of our *nusuk*[10] on this day of ours is that we begin by praying, then return and perform the sacrifice. So whoever does this, then he has agreed with our Sunnah. And whoever slaughters (his sacrifice) before that (i.e. the prayer), then it is only something he has put forth (in advance) for his family, it is not from the *nusuk* at all.'**"

Reported by Al-Bukhaaree (2.372), and the wording is from him. Ahmad (4/282), and Al-Muhaamilee (2/no. 90 and 96) also reported it. The "other narration" mentioned above belongs to them (i.e. Ahmad and Al-Muhaamilee) with a sound chain of narration.

The Fourth Hadeeth: From Ibn 'Abbaas, it was said to him: "Did you witness the 'Eid Prayer with the Prophet ﷺ?" He replied: "Yes. And if it were not for my place along with the children, I would not have witnessed it. I (was there) to the point when he reached the landmark by the home of Katheer bin as-Salt.[11] So there, he prayed and then gave the sermon. Then he went to the women with Bilaal next to him and admonished them and ordered them to give charity.[12] So I saw the women throwing their hands down and

[9] This is *Baqee' al-Gharqad*. It was given this name due to the thorny tree trunks found in it. It is the cemetery of Madeenah. Although there are many other cemeteries besides *al-Baqee'* in Madeenah, however this is the most famous out of all of them.

[10] *Nusuk* means Obedience and Worship; See *an-Nihaayah*.

[11] Al-Haafidh (Ibn Hajr) said: "Identifying the *musallaa* by it being near the home of Katheer bin as-Salt is a way of approximating its distance for the one hearing. And if this is not so, then the home of Katheer bin as-Salt was newly introduced after the death of the Prophet. What is clear from this hadeeth is that they made the *musallaa* something they could identify. This is what is meant by the word landmark ('*alam*), which means "something specific."

[12] As for now, then there should be no adhering to the specified admonition for women because they are the twins of men, and the speech and the admonition is one for both the men and the women. This is also due to the presence of the numerous loudspeakers found in every masjid and central mosque, which are normally brought out to the places of prayer for 'Eid.

tossing it (i.e. their jewelry) into Bilaal's garment with their hands. Then he and Bilaal would depart to his house."

Reported by Al-Bukhaaree (2/373) and the wording is from him, Muslim (2/18-19), Ibn Abee Shaybah (2/3/2), Al-Muhaamilee (no. 38-39), Al-Firyaabee (no. 85 and 93) and Abu Nu'aim in his *Mustakhraj* (2/8/2-9/1). In his narration, Muslim added the saying of Ibn Juraij:

"I said to 'Ataa: 'Is it a duty upon the Imaam nowadays to go to the women after finishing (the *khutbah*) and admonish them separately?' He said: 'By Allaah, indeed that is a duty binding upon them. What is wrong with them that they don't do that?!'"

THE PROOFS IN THE *AHAADEETH* THAT INDICATE THAT PRAYING IN THE *MUSALLAA* IS THE SUNNAH

When you come to realize these ahaadeeth, then (know that) they are a clear proof that the Sunnah regarding the two 'Eid Prayers is that they be performed in the *musallaa*. A majority of the scholars held this view, as is stated in *Sharh-us-Sunnah* of Imaam Al-Baghawee:

"The Sunnah is for the Imaam to go out for the two 'Eid Prayers, unless there is an excuse (for not going out). In that case, he may pray in the masjid."[13] He means by this a masjid inside of the city.

Imaam Muhiyy-ud-Deen An-Nawawee said in his Explanation of *Saheeh Muslim*, while speaking about the **First Hadeeth**:

"This is proof for the one who holds the view that it is recommended to go out for the 'Eid Prayer in the *musallaa*, and that it is better than praying it in the masjid. This is what the people are practicing in a majority of the lands. As for the people of Makkah, they do not pray it except in the masjid since the very first era. Our companions (i.e. the Shaafi'ee scholars) have two views in this regard:

The First: Praying it in an open area is better, based on this hadeeth.

The Second: Which is the most correct according to most of them, is that praying it in the masjid is better, however it is not ample enough.

They said: 'The People of Makkah only prayed ('Eid) in the masjid due to its ampleness (in that land). And the Prophet ﷺ only went out to the *musallaa* due to the constrictedness of the (Prophet's) masjid.' So this indicates that (praying 'Eid in) the masjid is better if it is wide and ample enough." [14]

---

[13] This is similar to what Shaikh 'Alee Al-Qaaree said in *al-Mirqaat* (2/245). See also *Sharh-us-Sunnah* (4/294) printed by Al-Maktab Al-Islaamee.

[14] In fact, a majority of them said the reason for it was because Makkah, may Allaah honor it, was placed between the mountains. Consequently, there cannot be found an open plain close to the homes, as close as the open flatland of the Holy House. This is one view that is acceptable.

A REFUTATION OF: JUSTIFYING PRAYING IN THE MUSALLAA DUE TO THE EXCUSE OF THE MASJID BEING SMALL

This is what they stated, but there is obvious speculation concerning it, for if the matter were as they claim it to be, the Prophet ﷺ would not have incited that it be performed in the *musallaa*. This is since he would not encourage something unless it was more preferable.

The view that the Prophet ﷺ only did that (i.e. pray 'Eid in the *musallaa*) because the masjid wasn't ample enough is a claim that has no proof for it. What supports this is the fact that the Prophet ﷺ would pray Jumu'ah in the masjid. And the people would come from the outskirts of Madeenah and other areas, and he ﷺ would lead them in prayer in it (i.e. the Prophet's masjid). There were no signs of any difference between the number of Sahaabah that attended the Jumu'ah Prayer and those that attended the 'Eid Prayers, such that it can be said: "The masjid would be ample enough for these attendees but not for those." And whoever claims something contrary to this then he must bring proof. But I can't imagine that he will be able to!

What further supports what we have stated above is that: If praying the two 'Eids in the masjid were better than praying them in the *musallaa*, but the masjid was too small, the Prophet ﷺ would have taken the necessary steps to expand it, just as some of the Khaleefahs after him did, for he has more right to expand it than them. So if the masjid wasn't ample enough for it, but yet the Prophet ﷺ left off expanding it, it is not possible to imagine this (i.e. that the masjid wasn't ample enough), along with the view that praying in the masjid is superior to the *musallaa*. This is unless someone claims that there was something that prevented him from expanding it. But I don't think a person of knowledge would have the nerve to make such a claim. And if any of them does do it, then we present to them the statement of Allaah, Blessed and Exalted:

قُلْ هَاتُوا۟ بُرْهَـٰنَكُمْ إِن كُنتُمْ صَـٰدِقِينَ

"Say: Bring forth your proof if you are truthful." [Surah Al-Baqarah: 111]

What is strange is that the Shaafi'ee scholars have made the Prophet's consistency in praying Jumu'ah in the (one) same masjid a proof that it is not permissible to have numerous Jumu'ah congregations in the (one) same city! But yet they don't make his ﷺ encouraging that the 'Eid Prayers be performed in the *musallaa* a proof that it is more virtuous to pray it in the *musallaa* than in the masjid (!), when the proof for these two issues is one, as you have seen!

All of this supports the first of the two opinions that Imaam An-Nawawee (*rahimahullaah*) mentioned as being from the *madh-hab* of the Shaafi'ee scholars.

Nevertheless, the difference between these two views is formal and not practical with regard to the example of the city of Damascus and other large cities, since the second opinion asserts that it is better to pray in masjid on the condition that it is ample enough to accommodate all of the attendees. However, the likes of this masjid does not exist. So in this case, the two views agree with one another, as is the *madh-hab* of the majority of the scholars – that it is more virtuous to pray ('Eid) in the *musallaa*. It has been reported from Imaam Ash-Shaafi'ee (*rahimahullaah*) that he detested praying ('Eid) in the masjid during the state where it is not ample enough, as will be mentioned later.

Al-Haafidh Ibn Hajr Al-'Asqalaanee said in *al-Fat'h* (2/450 of As-Salafiyah Printing) under the **First Hadeeth**:

"This hadeeth is used as proof for the preference of going out to the open field to perform the 'Eid Prayer, and that this is better than praying it in the masjid **due to the Prophet's encouraging it**, in spite of the virtue (i.e. reward) of praying in his ﷺ masjid.

Ash-Shaafi'ee said in *Al-Umm*: 'It has been conveyed to us that Allaah's Messenger would go out for the two 'Eid prayers to the *musallaa* in Madeenah. And this was done by those who came after him, unless there was an excuse to not do it, such as rain and so on. This was the case for the people of all the countries except for the inhabitants of Makkah.'

Then he indicated that the reason for this was due to the masjid (Al-Haraam) being ample and wide enough for the attendees, along with the fact that the borders of Makkah were constricted. He went on to say:

'But if the city is populated and the masjid is able to fit the people of this city during the days of 'Eid, I do not hold that they should go out from it (i.e. the city). But if it is not large enough to accommodate them, then I detest that the ('Eid) Prayer be performed in it. However, they do not have to repeat their prayer.' [15]

The result of this is that the Reason revolves around the fact of the masjid being either big or small, not due to the state of going out to the open area of land. This is since what is desired is to achieve the general unity of the masses. So if this can be achieved in the masjid, along with it's superiority, then that takes more precedence."

[15] *Al-Umm* (1/207); The text of his words will be mentioned later.

Imaam Ash-Shawkaanee commented on this saying (3/248): "In this is proof that the reason being either that the masjid was too small or too big, is just an estimation, and it doesn't show support that one can be excused from following the example he ﷺ set in going out to the *jabbaanah* (cemetery/open area), especially after acknowledging the fact that he ﷺ encouraged this.

As for establishing a proof that this was the reason why he ﷺ performed the prayer in the masjid of Makkah, then this can be responded to by saying that it is possible he left off going out to the *jabbaanah*[16] due to the narrow borders of Makkah and not due to the ampleness of its masjid."

I say: This probability that Imaam Ash-Shawkaanee mentioned is the same thing that Imaam Ash-Shaafi'ee indicated, in what Al-Haafidh Ibn Hajr quoted from him previously. Here is the text of Imaam Ash-Shaafi'ee's words from *Al-Umm* (1/207):

"I only say this because there was (this ampleness in the masjid), and they did not have this vast ampleness in the outskirts of their homes in Makkah."

This supports the view that Ash-Shawkaanee (*rahimahullaah*) took, which is that justifying the Prophet's not praying in the masjid because it was not big enough is just a matter of estimation, so it deserves to be rejected!

What can be used as proof for this "Reason" is the hadeeth reported by Al-Bayhaqee in *As-Sunan-ul-Kubraa* (3/310) from the path of Muhammad bin 'Abdil-'Azeez bin 'Abdir-Rahmaan from 'Uthmaan bin 'Abdir-Rahmaan At-Taymee who said:

"It rained severely on us one day during Abaan bin 'Uthmaan's rule over Madeenah – on the night of Al-Fitr.[17] So the people gathered together in the masjid (and prayed there), and they didn't go out to the *musallaa*, in which the 'Eids of Fitr and Adhaa used to be prayed in.

Then he (Abaan) said to 'Abdullaah bin 'Aamir bin Rabee'ah: 'Rise and inform the people what you have told me.' So 'Abdullaah bin 'Aamir said: 'Verily, the people were faced with rain during the time of 'Umar Ibn Al-Khattaab ﷺ, so the people refrained from the *musallaa*. So 'Umar gathered the people in the masjid and led them in prayer. Then he rose upon the *mimbar* and said: O people! Indeed Allaah's Messenger ﷺ would go out with the people to the *musallaa* and lead them there in prayer. This was because it was easier on them and more ample for them. And the masjid would not be big enough

---

[16] The word *Al-Jabbaanah* refers first and foremost to an open area of land. Furthermore, it is restricted to mean the cemeteries because they can be found in it. This is from the aspect of naming something due to its location. The same goes for *Al-Jabbaan*. [Zuhair].

[17] **Translator's Note:** He means by this the night before the day of 'Eid, and Allaah knows best.

to fit them.' Then he said: 'But if there occurs the likes of this rain, then (praying it in) the masjid is easier.'"

The Response is: This report is very weak because this Muhammad bin 'Abdil-'Azeez, who is Muhammad bin 'Abdil-'Azeez bin 'Umar bin 'Abdir-Rahmaan bin 'Awf, the Judge, Imaam Al-Bukhaaree said about him: "His hadeeth are rejected" and An-Nasaa'ee said of him: "*Matrook* (to be abandoned)."

Ash-Shaafi'ee reported this narration in *al-Umm* (1/207) through another path of narration on the authority of Abaan, apart from the *marfoo'* hadeeth. However, its chain is also very weak because it is from the reports of Ibraheem, the shaikh (teacher) of Ash-Shaafi'ee, who was Ibraaheem bin Muhammad bin Abee Yahyaa Al-Aslamee, and he was a liar. Maalik said about him that he was neither reliable in Hadeeth nor in his Religion. This is why Al-Haafidh (Ibn Hajr) said about him in *at-Taqreeb*: "He is *matrook* (to be abandoned)."

So it is confirmed by what was mentioned previously that the justification that the masjid was small is a false claim. And it strengthens the statements of the scholars, who firmly asserted that praying in the *musallaa* is the Sunnah, and that it is legislated in every era and land unless there is an emergency. I do not know of anyone amongst the distinguished scholars, whose knowledge is relied on, that opposed this.

Ibn Hazm said in *al-Muhallaa* (5/81): "And the Sunnah for the 'Eid Prayer is that: The people of each town or city go out to an open area of land in the proximity of their homes, in the forenoon."

Then he said (5/86): "And if they have difficulty in going out to the *musallaa*, then they may pray in congregation in the central mosque."

Then he said (5/87): "It has been reported to us from 'Umar and 'Uthmaan, may Allaah be pleased with them, that: They led the people in 'Eid Prayer in the masjid due to rain that occurred on the Day of 'Eid. However, the Messenger of Allaah ﷺ would go out to the *musallaa* to perform the 'Eid Prayers, so this is better. But doing other than it is permitted because it was an action on his part and not a command. And with Allaah lies the success."

The noble instructor, Shaikh Ahmad Muhammad Shaakir, the well known Muhaddith, has a very beneficial treatise discussing Praying 'Eid in the Musallaa and the Women going out to it. I felt it proper to quote some of it here due to the benefits found in it. He (*rahimahullaah*) said in his notes to At-Tirmidhee (2/421-424) after alluding to the First Hadeeth and mentioning what Ibn Juraij said to 'Ataa, which we mentioned previously under the **Fourth Hadeeth**: "Is it a duty upon the Imaam nowadays to go to the women

after finishing (the khutbah) and admonish them separately', and his reply: 'By Allaah, indeed that is a duty binding upon them." Shaikh Ahmad Shaakir said: "The statements of the scholars are many in this regard."

Thus, the great scholar Al-'Aynee Al-Hanafee said in his Explanation to Saheeh Al-Bukhaaree while expounding on the hadeeth of Abu Sa'eed (6/280-281): 'In this is proof for going out to the *musallaa* and that one should not pray in the masjid, unless there is a necessity forcing him to do so.'"

And Ibn Ziyaad reported from Imaam Maalik (*rahimahullaah*), that he said: "The Sunnah is to go out to the *Jabbaanah*, except for the people of Makkah, for they do it in the masjid."

And in the book *al-Fatawaa al-Hindiyyah* (vol. 1, pg. 118), it states: "Going out to the *Jabbaanah* for the 'Eid Prayer is Sunnah, even if the central mosque is large enough to accommodate the people. This is what the mashaayikh are upon and it is the correct view."

And it is stated in *al-Mudawwanah*, which is reported from Maalik (vol. 1, pg. 171) that Imaam Maalik said: "One should not pray the two 'Eids in two locations, and the people should not pray in their masjid. Rather, they should go out just as the Prophet ﷺ used to. Ibn Wahb reported from Yoonus from bin hihaab that he said: **'Allaah's Messenger would go out to the *musallaa*, then the Ansaar (i.e. inhabitants of Madeenah) would follow this practice after him.'"**

Ibn Qudaamah Al-Hanbalee said in *al-Mughnee* (vol. 2, pg. 229-230): "The Sunnah is to pray 'Eid in the *musallaa*. This is what 'Alee ﵁ ordered and the view that Al-Awzaa'ee and the people of Opinion (*rayy*) favored. This is also the view of Ibn Al-Mundhir. It is related from Ash-Shaafi'ee that he said: 'If the masjid in the city is ample enough, then praying in it is better, because it is the best and purest of locations. This is why the people of Makkah pray in Al-Masjid Al-Haraam.'

And we have been informed that the Prophet ﷺ would go out to the *musallaa* and abandon praying in his masjid. This is also what the Khaleefahs did after him. The Prophet ﷺ did not abandon choosing the 'better option' (i.e. masjid) even with its closeness nor did he opt for the 'lesser of the two' (i.e. *musallaa*) along with its remoteness. Nor did he legislate for his ummah to leave off what was more preferable. And we have been commanded to follow the Prophet and to take his example. So it is not possible that the thing that we are commanded to do be the less preferable one, whilst that which we were forbidden from be the better choice. So it is not reported on the Prophet ﷺ that he ever prayed 'Eid in his masjid, unless it was due to some excuse (i.e. difficulty). And because all of this is unanimously agreed upon by the scholars, the

people in every generation and in every area practiced going out to the *musallaa*. So they pray 'Eid in the *musallaa* regardless of whether the masjid is large or small. And the Prophet ﷺ would pray in the *musallaa* in spite of the virtue of praying in his masjid."

I say: In Ibn Qudaamah's statement "It is not reported on the Prophet ﷺ that he ever prayed 'Eid in his masjid, unless it was due to some excuse (i.e. difficulty)", he is indicating the following hadeeth of Abu Hurairah ؓ in *Al-Mustadrak* of Al-Haakim (vol. 1, pg. 295): **"And rain befell them on the Day of 'Eid so the Prophet led them in prayer in the masjid."**

He (i.e. Al-Haakim) and Adh-Dhahabee authenticated it. [18]

Imaam Ash-Shaafi'ee said in his book *al-Umm* (1/207): "It has been conveyed to us that Allaah's Messenger ﷺ would go out for the two 'Eid Prayers to the *musallaa* in Madeenah. And the same was done by those after him and the masses of the inhabitants of each city, except for Makkah, for it has not reached us that any of the Salaf would lead the people (of Makkah) in 'Eid Prayer except in their masjid (i.e. Al-Masjid Al-Haraam). I love (i.e. prefer) this, and Allaah knows best, because Al-Masjid Al-Haraam is the best place on earth. So the people there did not love that there be a prayer except that they performed it in there, as much as they were able to. I only say this, because there was (this ampleness in the masjid), and they didn't have this same wide ampleness in the outskirts of the homes in Makkah. And I do not know of them performing any 'Eid or Istisqaa Prayer except that it was held in it (i.e. Al-Masjid Al-Haraam). So if the city is populated and the masjid is able to fit the people of this city during the days of 'Eid, I do not hold that they should go out from it (i.e. the masjid). But if they go outside from it, then there is no harm in this.

[18] There is obvious speculation to this authentication, because according to Al-Haakim the extent that it reaches is: 'Eesaa bin 'Abdil-A'alaa bin Abee Farwah heard from Abu Yahyaa 'Ubaydillaah At-Taymee that he narrated it from Abu Hurairah. It was also reported this way by Abu Dawood (1/180), Ibn Maajah (1/394) and Al-Bayhaqee (3/210). This chain of narration is weak, since this 'Eesaa is unknown (*majhool*), as has been stated by Al-Haafidh in *At-Taqreeb*. The same goes for his shaikh (teacher), Abu Yahyaa, who is 'Ubaydullaah bin 'Abdillaah bin Muwahhab. He is unknown. Adh-Dhahabee said in his abridgement of *Sunan Al-Bayhaqee* (1/160/1): "I say 'Ubaydullaah is weak." And in his biography of Ar-Raazee in *Al-Meezaan*, he (Adh-Dhahabee) said: "He barely knew, and this is a rejected hadeeth."

I say: So his agreeing with Al-Haakim in his authentication of this hadeeth in (his book) *Talkhees-ul-Mustadrak* is from the many errors he committed in it, which we hope will be pardoned! This is why Al-Haafidh (Ibn Hajr) asserted in his *Talkhees-ul-Habeer* (pg. 144) and also in his *Buloogh-ul-Maraam* (2/99) that: "Its chain is weak." So An-Nawawee's statement in *Al-Majmoo'* (5/5): "Its chain is good" is not correct. It looks as if he is relying on Abu Dawood's silence when grading it, but this doesn't mean anything, because Abu Dawood would remain silent many times about ahaadeeth of which their weakness was clear. This has been mentioned in *Al-Mustalah* and I have explained it in my book *Saheeh Sunan Abee Dawood*.

But in the case that it is not ample enough to accommodate them, and an Imaam leads them in prayer in it, I dislike this for him. However, they do not have to repeat their prayer. And if there occurs some excusable matter, such as rain and so on, I command him to pray in the masaajid and to not go out to the open area of land."

The 'Allaamah, Ibn Al-Hajj, said in *al-Madkhal* (283): "The historical Sunnah with regard to the two 'Eid Prayers is that they be performed in the *musallaa*, because the Prophet ﷺ said: **'Prayer in this masjid of mine is better than one thousand prayers in any other masjid, except for Al-Masjid Al-Haraam.'**[19] However, in spite of its great virtue, he ﷺ went out to the *musallaa* and abandoned praying in this masjid. This is clear proof of the strong status that going out to the *musallaa* for the 'Eid Prayers holds. So therefore, it is the Sunnah. And praying it in the masjid, according to the *madh-hab* of Imaam Maalik is an innovation, unless there is a necessity that compels them to do that. In this case it would not be an innovation.

This is since the Prophet ﷺ never did it, nor did any of the rightly-guided Khaleefahs after him. And it is also because he ﷺ ordered the women to come out to the 'Eid Prayers. And he ordered the menstruating women and the young girls to go out to it also. So one of them said to him: **'O Messenger of Allaah! One of us doesn't have her jilbaab.'** So the Prophet ﷺ replied: **'Let her sister cover her using her jilbaab, so that they can witness the good and the supplication of the Muslims.'** So when the Prophet ﷺ legislated for them to go out (to the *musallaa*), praying in the open area of land also became legislated, in order to manifest one of the tenets of Islaam."

So the Prophetic Sunnah, which has been mentioned in the authentic ahaadeeth indicates that the Prophet ﷺ would perform the 'Eid Prayers in the open area of land outside of the city. This practice continued to be implemented in the first generation (of Muslims after him), and they would not pray 'Eid in the masaajid, unless there was a necessity for it, such as due to rain and so on. This is the *madh-hab* (opinion) of the four Imaams as well as other scholars, may Allaah be pleased with all of them.

I don't know of anyone that opposes this, except perhaps the statement of Ash-Shaafi'ee, may Allaah be pleased with him, where he prefers that 'Eid be prayed in the masjid if it is large enough to accommodate all of the people in the city. However, in spite of this, he didn't see anything wrong in praying in the open area of land, even if the masjid could fit all of them. He, may Allaah be pleased with him, also asserted that he detested performing the 'Eid Prayers in the masjid if it was not large enough to accommodate all of the attendees.

[19] This hadeeth reaches the level of being *mutawaatir*. See *Irwaa-ul-Ghaleel* (no. 953) and *Saheeh-ul-Jaami'* (no. 3732) [Zuhair]

So these authentic ahaadeeth and other narrations, the Muslims of the first generation persevering upon this practice, and the statements of the scholars – all of these provide evidence that performing the 'Eid Prayers in the masaajid is an innovation. We can even derive this from the statement of Imaam Ash-Shaafi'ee, since there doesn't exist a single masjid within our cities that is large enough to accommodate all of the people who live in that city.

THE WISDOM BEHIND PRAYING IN THE MUSALLAA

Furthermore, there is great and profound wisdom behind this Sunnah – i.e. the Sunnah of praying in an open area of land (i.e. the *musallaa*). And it is that: The Muslims will have two days out of the year where all the people of every city can gather together – whether men, women or children – and turn towards Allaah with their hearts in unity, praying behind one Imaam, making the *takbeer* and the *tahleel* and supplicating to Allaah sincerely together, as if they were united upon the heart of one man, happy and joyous about the blessing Allaah has bestowed on them. So the 'Eid will truly be an occasion of celebration for them.

Allaah's Messenger ﷺ ordered the women to go out to pray 'Eid along with the people, and he did not make an exception for any of them. This is even to the point that he made no excuses for those women who did not have a garment by which they could veil themselves when coming out, as instead he commanded them to borrow garments from other women. And this is even to the point that he ﷺ commanded those women who had a reason that prevented them from praying (i.e. menses) to go out to the *musallaa*, so that they may **"witness the good and the supplication of the Muslims."**

The Prophet ﷺ, and then his Khaleefahs (successors) after him, and the delegated leaders in the cities would lead the people in prayer. Then they would give them a sermon saying that which would admonish them. And they would teach them what would be of benefit to them in this world and in the Hereafter. And they would order them to give in charity in that gathering. So the rich person would show affection towards the poor person. And the poor would find joy in what Allaah has given them from His Bounty during this blessed assembly, which Allaah's Mercy and Contentment descends upon.

So it is only proper for the Muslims to respond to following the Sunnah of their Prophet and reviving the rites of their Religion, which is the point of their resolution and success.

يَٰٓأَيُّهَا ٱلَّذِينَ ءَامَنُوا۟ ٱسْتَجِيبُوا۟ لِلَّهِ وَلِلرَّسُولِ إِذَا دَعَاكُمْ لِمَا يُحْيِيكُمْ ۖ

"O you who believe! Respond to Allaah and to the Messenger when He calls you to that which will revive you." [Surah Al-Anfaal: 24]

Shaikh Waliyullaah Ad-Dihlawee said in *Hujjatullaah-il-Baalighah* under the heading "The Two 'Eids" (2/30-32):

“The foundation with regard to them is that every nation has a day in which they beautify themselves and go out from their city with their adornment. This is a custom, which no group amongst the Arabs and non-Arabs have stopped practicing. When the Prophet ﷺ came to Madeenah, he found that the people had two days in which they would go out and enjoy themselves, so he said: **‘Allaah has replaced these two days with something that is better than them – the Day of Adhaa and the Day of Fitr.’**[20] It was said that these two (prior) days of celebration were: An-Nayrooz and Al-Mahrajaan.

These two days were only replaced because there is no ‘Eid for a group of people except that the reason for its existence is to elevate the rites of a Religion or to comply with the founders of a particular way or something that resembles that. So the Prophet feared that if he were to leave them with their custom, there would remain this elevating of the rites of Jaahiliyyah (i.e. the Days of Ignorance) or the propagating of the (false) ways of the ancestors. So he ﷺ replaced them with two days in which there was found an elevating of the rites of the pure and upright Religion (of Islaam). And along with adorning oneself for the occasion, he ﷺ included the remembrance of Allaah as well as various acts of obedience, so that the gathering of the Muslims won’t just be for pure play and enjoyment, and so that no gathering from them will be void of raising Allaah’s Word.

The first of these two days is ‘Eid-ul-Fitr, the day when they end their fasting and give a certain type of their Zakaat. So they experience this ‘natural joy’ that is caused by their withdrawing from conditions that were difficult upon them (i.e. the fast). And the poor person experiences joy at taking his charity.

The ‘intellectual joy’ they experience is due to the delight of knowing that Allaah has blessed them with the ability to complete what He made obligatory upon them (i.e. the fast)…

The second is the day when Ibraaheem (intended to) sacrifice his son Ismaa’eel, may Allaah be pleased with both of them. But Allaah blessed them both by replacing him with the great sacrifice (i.e. a ram). This is since on this day, one can be reminded and take heed of the condition of the ancestors of this noble and upright religion, by sacrificing one’s soul and wealth in obeying Allaah, and having firm patience. In this, there is a similarity to those performing Hajj, where one tries to emulate them and longs to be in the state they are in. This is why it is legislated to make the Takbeer in it, which is found in Allaah’s saying:

[20] I say: Ahmad and others reported it with an authentic chain of narration. I have referenced it in *as-Saheehah* (no. 2021).

وَلِتُكْمِلُواْ ٱلْعِدَّةَ وَلِتُكَبِّرُواْ ٱللَّهَ عَلَىٰ مَا هَدَىٰكُمْ وَلَعَلَّكُمْ تَشْكُرُونَ

'And so that you may magnify Allaah (by making Takbeer) for having guided you and so that you may be grateful.' [Surah Al-Baqarah: 185; Surah Al-Hajj: 37]

This means: Give thanks to Him for granting you the ability to fast. This is why performing the sacrifice and saying the *takbeer* out loud were legislated on the Days of Minaa. And this is why it is recommended for those who intend to offer the sacrifice to abandon shaving (the body hair).[21] And this is also why the Prayer and the *Khutbah* (sermon) were prescribed – so that no part of their gathering could be void of the remembrance of Allaah and the elevating of the rites of the Religion.

Another objective from the objectives of the Pure Legislation is included in this, which is that: Every nation must have some presentation, in which its people gather together during it to display their strength and to show their numbers. This is why it is recommended for everyone to go out (to the *musallaa*) – even the children, the women, the young girls and the menstruating women. However, they (i.e. menstruating women) must not join the *musallaa* (i.e. the prayer) but rather witness the supplication of the Muslims.

And it is also why the Prophet ﷺ would vary in the roads he took when going and coming from the *musallaa*, so that the people in each of the roads would see the strength of the Muslims. And since the origin of 'Eid was to decorate and adorn oneself, it is recommended to wear one's best garment, to enjoy oneself (*taqlees*),[22] to take different routes when going and coming and to go out to the *musallaa*." [End Quote]

---

[21] I say: He is indicating the Prophet's statement: **"When the Hilaal (crescent) for Dhul-Hijjah is sighted and one of you wants to offer a sacrifice, then he must refrain from cutting his hair and nails."** And in one narration: **"…then let him not cut any part of his hair or nails until he offers the sacrifice."** [See *Mukhtasar Saheeh Muslim* (no. 1251) and others] I say: It is apparent from the hadeeth that anyone who is determined to perform the sacrifice is obligated not to cut his hair and nails until he offers the sacrifice. So this type of cutting mentioned above is forbidden. Imaam Ahmad and others held this view. So let those who are tested with shaving their beards take note of this, for indeed, there are three sinful matters in their shaving of their beards for the day of 'Eid:
First: The shaving itself, for it is a feminine trait, an imitation of the disbelievers, and an alteration of Allaah's creation, as I have explained in my book *"Adaab az-Zafaaf fis-Sunnah al-Mutahharah* (Sixth Edition, pg. 118).
Second: Adorning oneself for the day of 'Eid by disobeying Allaah.
Third: What is derived from this hadeeth of the forbiddance of cutting the hair for the one who intends to offer the sacrifice. In reality, there are very few people that are saved from committing this (sin), even some of the people of knowledge (do it)! We ask Allaah to protect us.

[22] Shaikh Ad-Dihlawee said in his footnote: "*Taqlees* (Enjoying oneself) means beating the duff and playing when the kings arrive, in order to welcome them." I say: He is indicating the hadeeth that has been reported by Ibn Maajah (1/391) and others with two chains of narration. In one of them is Shareek, who is Ibn 'Abdillaah Al-Qaadee – he had bad memory. And in the other chain is found Abu Ishaaq, who is As-Subay'ee – he would mix up his narrations. At-Tahaawee weakened it in his *Mushkil-ul-Athaar* (2/209-210) based on two angles, so refer to it if you wish.

A MISCONCEPTION AND A REPLY TO IT

You have come to know from what we explained previously that: Praying the two 'Eids in the *musallaa* is the Sunnah, and that this is an issue which the Imaams have unanimously agreed on from the viewpoint of its implementation. There are many benefits and wisdom to praying them in the *musallaa*, of which many of these cannot be achieved if they are performed in the masaajid or the masjid. Due to this, the Muslims should return to the Sunnah of their Prophet ﷺ and they should assist those who are trying to revive this Sunnah in these lands, for indeed Allaah's Hand is over the Jamaa'ah (unified body) – the Jamaa'ah of the Sunnah not the Jamaa'ah that is in opposition to it.

It is not befitting for someone with intellect to say: "Reviving this Sunnah will cause a split in the Jamaa'ah (unified body) of Muslims. If the people are already praying it in the masaajid in numerous congregations, then establishing it in the *musallaa* constitutes separating away from their ranks and creating a new Jamaa'ah (group), which we are not in need of. Rather we are in need of minimizing these Jamaa'aat (groups) and not adding to them!"

So we say in reply to them:

It is not befitting for a Muslim of intellect to make such a statement. This is since it is understood from his words that which one cannot imagine a believer would intend. This is because what is meant by this statement is that implementing the Sunnah, which all of the Imaams held the view of as we have explained, is the cause for the splitting of the Muslims and dividing their Jamaa'ah (unified body)! Imagining something like this is sufficient alone to nullify such a statement.

Rather, the reality, which we worship Allaah with, is that: There is no way to gather the Muslims together and unify their ranks except in returning to the Sunnah, especially the "implementation" aspect of it, which the Messenger of Allaah adhered to for the length of his life and which he left his ummah and those after him upon.

If you want to see a good example of this, then take the one we are upon (today) of praying in the *musallaa*.

The Muslims today, with regard to this prayer, have split up into numerous jamaa'aat (congregations), in contradiction to the Sunnah, as has been stated previously. So when we desire to unite them into one congregation, then there is no way possible for us to do this unless we go out to the open area of land, which is ample enough to accommodate all of those praying – both men and women. They can take this land as a *musallaa*, wherein they can perform this great act of worship [the 'Eid Prayer]. This is what the

Sunnah orders. So how can it be said after this: "Implementing this Sunnah will cause division to the Jamaa'ah?!"

Yes. Indeed from the things in which there is no doubt is that reviving this Sunnah requires the creation of a new jamaa'ah (congregation), which will be separate from those other jamaa'aat (congregations) that are divided up in several masaajid. However, since the goal of this new jamaa'ah is to gather together those other jamaa'aat into one unified congregation, as the way it used to be during the time of Allaah's Messenger ﷺ and his rightly-guided Khaleefahs, there must exist this Jamaa'ah. This is since the one unified Jamaa'ah will never be established in a single bound, and it will never be established unless through them (i.e. those who break away and pray in the *musallaa*).

And from what has been agreed upon in the Usool (Fundamental Principles) is that: Whatever is necessary for establishing the obligation becomes itself obligatory.

So this confirms the acknowledgement that there is a need for the presence of this Jamaa'ah since it is the one that is upon the Sunnah. And its main objective is to achieve this Jamaa'ah, according to the vastest of its meanings, contrary to those other jamaa'aat.

Perhaps someone will say: "Lets say many sincere people ***do*** answer the call of this Jamaa'ah after the Sunnah is clarified to them. However, it is most likely that many more people will continue to be divided up throughout the various masaajid, contrary to the Sunnah and to all of the *madhaahib*. Because of this, the unified body of Muslims (Jamaa'ah) that is desired will not be achieved!"

I say: The truth is that this is what will most likely happen. However, what is clear at this point is that those who revive the Sunnah and call the people to it will not be held accountable for that. On the contrary, the blame will fall on those who persist in opposing this Sunnah. So the criticism only falls on them.

As for the first group, then their Jamaa'ah is what is legislated, because it is in accordance with the Sunnah, which Allaah's Messenger ﷺ was upon. The Prophet ﷺ said when describing the Saved Sect:

"It is the *Jamaa'ah*."

In another narration, he said: **"It is that which I and my Companions are upon."** [23]

---

[23] I say: Its chain of narration is *hasan* (sound) due to other narrations. At-Tirmidhee reported it from Ibn 'Amr and declared it *hasan*. At-Tabaraanee and others reported it from Anas. It has been referenced along with the first narration – which is authentic – in *Silsilat-ul-Ahaadeeth as-Saheehah* (no. 204)

So the opposition they face from their opponents does not harm them in the least, even if they are more than them in number, due to the Prophet's saying:

"There will not cease to be a group from my Ummah triumphant upon the truth. They will not be harmed by those who abandon them until the Order of Allaah comes and they are in that state." [24]

So the believer does not become disheartened by the little amount of people on the paths of guidance nor does he feel hurt by the large amount of those in opposition.

Imaam Ash-Shaatibee said in *al-'Itisaam* (1/12): "This is the Way of Allaah toward His creation – that the People of Truth as compared the People of Falsehood are few in number. This is based on Allaah's saying:

وَمَآ أَكۡثَرُ ٱلنَّاسِ وَلَوۡ حَرَصۡتَ بِمُؤۡمِنِينَ ١٠٣

'And most of mankind will not believe even if you desire it eagerly.' [Surah Yoosuf: 103]

And His saying:

وَقَلِيلٌ مِّنۡ عِبَادِيَ ٱلشَّكُورُ ١٣

'And few amongst My servants are grateful.' [Surah Saba': 13]

And it is also due to Allaah fulfilling the promise He made to His Prophet ﷺ that the description of being a stranger will return to it.[25] Strangeness does not come about except with the loss or decrease of people (upon that way). This will be at the time when the good becomes evil and the evil becomes good, and when the Sunnah becomes innovation and the innovation becomes the Sunnah. So the People of the Sunnah will be met with blame and rebuke,[26] just as it was in the beginning for the People of

[24] This is an authentic mutawaatir hadeeth, which I have referenced in the afore-mentioned source. Also see my abridgement to *Saheeh Muslim* (no. 1095) and *Saheeh al-Jaami'-us-Sagheer* (no. 7166)

[25] Meaning: "…to Islaam." He is alluding to the hadeeth of the Prophet: **"Islaam began strange and it will return to being strange as it began. So Toobaa is for the Strangers."** Reported by Muslim and others, and I have referenced it in *as-Saheehah* (no. 1273)

[26] This is as the authors of the treatise *Al-Isaabah* did to us, for after asserting their instability with regard to their view on "Praying 'Eid in an Open Area of Land", as has been stated previously, they went on to say: "There did not cease to exist amongst the Muslims those who preserved the prayers and the commands of their Religion and Prayer. But then there rose a small gang, which rejected them and split up the Jamaa'ah." So look at how they made calling

Innovation, since the innovator hoped that the ranks of the deviants would unite. But Allaah refused that their ranks unite until the Day of Judgement. So all of the deviant groups will never unite – regardless of their large numbers – in opposing the Sunnah – whether in its practice or its being conveyed. On the contrary, the Jamaa'ah of Ahlus-Sunnah will always remain firm and established until the Order of Allaah comes. However, due to the large amount of attacks the Deviant Sects wage against them and due to their showing of intense enmity and hatred for them – all because they called them to agree with them – they will not cease in their Jihaad (Striving), disagreeing, defending and fighting, day and night. Because of this, Allaah will multiply their reward enormously and will recompense them with the greatest of gifts."

I ask Allaah that He make us firm upon the Sunnah and that He allow us to die while on it. This is the last of what I was able to gather in this short time, thus all praise is due to Allaah, Lord of the Worlds.

[End of Treatise]

to the Sunnah into splitting the Jamaa'ah! How truthful was the one who said: "It flung its disease on me and then snuck away."